

*RAILS  
Institution #2 Data Analysis*   
Bei Yu & Megan Oakleaf

Table: librarians: 1; faculty: 2

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Instit | A | B | C | D | E | F | G | H | J | K | L |
| 2 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 1 |

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Krippendorff’s Alpha | | |
| criterion | All judges | Librarians(1) | Faculty(2) |
| 1 (124035) | .6679 | .6653 | .6772 |
| 2 (124036) | .7532 | .7162 | .7646 |
| 3 (124037) | .3185 | .2363 | .3813 |
| 4 (124038) | .2828 | .2273 | .3461 |
| 5 (124039) | .2814 | .1521 | .3349 |
| 6 (124040) | .4306 | .4047 | .4364 |
| 7 (124041) | .5661 | .5272 | .5840 |
| Total score | .6361 | .5817 | .6571 |

**pairwise Kappa agreement on criterion code 1 (124035):**

Mean Kappa for all judges=.488

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2B | 2C | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2H | 2J | 2K | 2L |
| 2A | .332 | .417 | .488 | .397 | .395 | .330 | .268 | .307 | .451 | .347 |
| 2B |  | .565 | .628 | .640 | .551 | .502 | .553 | .537 | .524 | .444 |
| 2C |  |  | .627 | .609 | .508 | .497 | .484 | .457 | .425 | .361 |
| 2D |  |  |  | .638 | .611 | .517 | .551 | .503 | .441 | .502 |
| 2E |  |  |  |  | .478 | .438 | .490 | .445 | .505 | .499 |
| 2F |  |  |  |  |  | .389 | .616 | .605 | .430 | .545 |
| 2G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .371 | .363 | .357 | .317 |
| 2H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .683 | .418 | .719 |
| 2J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .501 | .724 |
| 2K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .538 |

Mean Kappa for librarians=.477

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2C | 2H | 2J | 2L |
| 2A | .417 | .268 | .307 | .347 |
| 2C |  | .484 | .457 | .361 |
| 2H |  |  | .683 | .719 |
| 2J |  |  |  | .724 |

Mean Kappa for faculty=.510

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2K |
| 2B | .628 | .640 | .551 | .502 | .524 |
| 2D |  | .638 | .611 | .517 | .441 |
| 2E |  |  | .478 | .438 | .505 |
| 2F |  |  |  | .389 | .430 |
| 2G |  |  |  |  | .357 |

**Cohen’s Kappa pairwise measure on criterion 2 (124036):**

Mean Kappa for all judges=.651

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2B | 2C | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2H | 2J | 2K | 2L |
| 2A | .385 | .512 | .519 | .462 | .536 | .398 | .409 | .478 | .536 | .463 |
| 2B |  | .824 | .721 | .662 | .716 | .566 | .814 | .517 | .746 | .722 |
| 2C |  |  | .828 | .776 | .827 | .629 | .817 | .552 | .886 | .809 |
| 2D |  |  |  | .693 | .788 | .573 | .710 | .583 | .821 | .749 |
| 2E |  |  |  |  | .712 | .580 | .695 | .541 | .835 | .783 |
| 2F |  |  |  |  |  | .612 | .751 | .553 | .774 | .789 |
| 2G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .573 | .416 | .572 | .657 |
| 2H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .503 | .734 | .756 |
| 2J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .597 | .542 |
| 2K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .778 |

Mean Kappa for librarians=.584

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2C | 2H | 2J | 2L |
| 2A | .512 | .409 | .478 | .463 |
| 2C |  | .817 | .552 | .809 |
| 2H |  |  | .503 | .756 |
| 2J |  |  |  | .542 |

Mean Kappa for faculty=.691

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2K |
| 2B | .721 | .662 | .716 | .566 | .746 |
| 2D |  | .693 | .788 | .573 | .821 |
| 2E |  |  | .712 | .580 | .835 |
| 2F |  |  |  | .612 | .774 |
| 2G |  |  |  |  | .572 |

**Cohen’s Kappa pairwise measure on criterion 3 (124037):**

Mean Kappa for all judges=.194

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2B | 2C | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2H | 2J | 2K | 2L |
| 2A | .085 | .050 | .119 | .141 | .065 | .132 | .112 | -.030 | .036 | .180 |
| 2B |  | .231 | .361 | .343 | .223 | .254 | .241 | .172 | .075 | .274 |
| 2C |  |  | .273 | .233 | .125 | .162 | .152 | .323 | .093 | .344 |
| 2D |  |  |  | .219 | .270 | .290 | .381 | .125 | .215 | .302 |
| 2E |  |  |  |  | .126 | .348 | .208 | .133 | .288 | .251 |
| 2F |  |  |  |  |  | .168 | .310 | .091 | .273 | .150 |
| 2G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .328 | .149 | .122 | .196 |
| 2H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .074 | .199 | .200 |
| 2J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | -.001 | .189 |
| 2K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .275 |

Mean Kappa for librarians=.159

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2C | 2H | 2J | 2L |
| 2A | .050 | .112 | -.030 | .180 |
| 2C |  | .152 | .323 | .344 |
| 2H |  |  | .074 | .200 |
| 2J |  |  |  | .189 |

Mean Kappa for faculty=.238

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2K |
| 2B | .361 | .343 | .223 | .254 | .075 |
| 2D |  | .219 | .270 | .290 | .215 |
| 2E |  |  | .126 | .348 | .288 |
| 2F |  |  |  | .168 | .273 |
| 2G |  |  |  |  | .122 |

**Cohen’s Kappa pairwise measure on criterion 4 (124038):**

Mean Kappa for all judges=.160

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2B | 2C | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2H | 2J | 2K | 2L |
| 2A | .102 | .251 | .196 | .072 | .050 | .102 | .090 | .187 | .016 | -.038 |
| 2B |  | .095 | .258 | .162 | .193 | .127 | .211 | .138 | .104 | .186 |
| 2C |  |  | .290 | .012 | .063 | .086 | .162 | .322 | -.001 | .047 |
| 2D |  |  |  | .192 | .191 | .205 | .189 | .238 | .244 | .213 |
| 2E |  |  |  |  | .360 | .230 | .319 | -.014 | .297 | .324 |
| 2F |  |  |  |  |  | .143 | .184 | .095 | .154 | .267 |
| 2G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .340 | .145 | .167 | .174 |
| 2H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .078 | .151 | .258 |
| 2J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | -.041 | .060 |
| 2K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .162 |

Mean Kappa for librarians=.142

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2C | 2H | 2J | 2L |
| 2A | .251 | .090 | .187 | -.038 |
| 2C |  | .162 | .322 | .047 |
| 2H |  |  | .078 | .258 |
| 2J |  |  |  | .060 |

Mean Kappa for faculty=.202

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2K |
| 2B | .258 | .162 | .193 | .127 | .104 |
| 2D |  | .192 | .191 | .205 | .244 |
| 2E |  |  | .360 | .230 | .297 |
| 2F |  |  |  | .143 | .154 |
| 2G |  |  |  |  | .167 |

**Cohen’s Kappa pairwise measure on criterion 5 (124039):**

Mean Kappa for all judges=.145

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2B | 2C | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2H | 2J | 2K | 2L |
| 2A | .136 | -.130 | .017 | .308 | .122 | .102 | .114 | .019 | .242 | .193 |
| 2B |  | .164 | .314 | .224 | .048 | .104 | .023 | .262 | -.013 | .183 |
| 2C |  |  | .297 | .226 | .219 | .123 | .186 | .115 | .082 | .149 |
| 2D |  |  |  | .182 | .139 | .088 | .156 | .118 | .140 | .197 |
| 2E |  |  |  |  | .123 | .150 | .175 | .126 | .135 | .111 |
| 2F |  |  |  |  |  | .150 | .359 | .050 | .196 | .231 |
| 2G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .251 | .101 | .156 | .114 |
| 2H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | -.015 | .103 | .245 |
| 2J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .056 | .035 |
| 2K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .258 |

Mean Kappa for librarians=.091

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2C | 2H | 2J | 2L |
| 2A | -.130 | .114 | .019 | .193 |
| 2C |  | .186 | .115 | .149 |
| 2H |  |  | -.015 | .245 |
| 2J |  |  |  | .035 |

Mean Kappa for faculty=.142

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2K |
| 2B | .314 | .224 | .048 | .104 | -.013 |
| 2D |  | .182 | .139 | .088 | .140 |
| 2E |  |  | .123 | .150 | .135 |
| 2F |  |  |  | .150 | .196 |
| 2G |  |  |  |  | .156 |

**Cohen’s Kappa pairwise measure on criterion 6 (124040):**

Mean Kappa for all judges=.251

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2B | 2C | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2H | 2J | 2K | 2L |
| 2A | .205 | .186 | .142 | .229 | .120 | .050 | .362 | .121 | .229 | .255 |
| 2B |  | .410 | .369 | .180 | .303 | .323 | .297 | .187 | .280 | .320 |
| 2C |  |  | .364 | .231 | .215 | .385 | .251 | .248 | .241 | .279 |
| 2D |  |  |  | .199 | .291 | .322 | .322 | .302 | .180 | .402 |
| 2E |  |  |  |  | .053 | .182 | .397 | .128 | .371 | .259 |
| 2F |  |  |  |  |  | .253 | .252 | .294 | .147 | .228 |
| 2G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .230 | .173 | .265 | .178 |
| 2H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .230 | .376 | .395 |
| 2J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .117 | .171 |
| 2K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .326 |

Mean Kappa for librarians=.250

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2C | 2H | 2J | 2L |
| 2A | .186 | .362 | .121 | .255 |
| 2C |  | .251 | .248 | .279 |
| 2H |  |  | .230 | .395 |
| 2J |  |  |  | .171 |

Mean Kappa for faculty=.248

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2K |
| 2B | .369 | .180 | .303 | .323 | .280 |
| 2D |  | .199 | .291 | .322 | .180 |
| 2E |  |  | .053 | .182 | .371 |
| 2F |  |  |  | .253 | .147 |
| 2G |  |  |  |  | .265 |

**Cohen’s Kappa pairwise measure on criterion 7 (124041):**

Mean Kappa for all judges=.428

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2B | 2C | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2H | 2J | 2K | 2L |
| 2A | .214 | .340 | .192 | .126 | .112 | .133 | .250 | .167 | .253 | .118 |
| 2B |  | .589 | .785 | .307 | .331 | .453 | .717 | .354 | .592 | .305 |
| 2C |  |  | .653 | .447 | .454 | .502 | .709 | .426 | .620 | .419 |
| 2D |  |  |  | .360 | .378 | .473 | .682 | .380 | .656 | .355 |
| 2E |  |  |  |  | .436 | .356 | .331 | .617 | .337 | .756 |
| 2F |  |  |  |  |  | .409 | .344 | .481 | .495 | .544 |
| 2G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .471 | .412 | .551 | .378 |
| 2H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .364 | .576 | .299 |
| 2J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .419 | .741 |
| 2K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .396 |

Mean Kappa for librarians=.383

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2C | 2H | 2J | 2L |
| 2A | .340 | .250 | .167 | .118 |
| 2C |  | .709 | .426 | .419 |
| 2H |  |  | .364 | .299 |
| 2J |  |  |  | .741 |

s

Mean Kappa for faculty=.461

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2K |
| 2B | .785 | .307 | .331 | .453 | .592 |
| 2D |  | .360 | .378 | .473 | .656 |
| 2E |  |  | .436 | .356 | .337 |
| 2F |  |  |  | .409 | .495 |
| 2G |  |  |  |  | .551 |

**Summary of Mean Cohen’s Kappa**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Criterion | Librarians(1) | Faculty(2) | All judges |
| 1 (124035) | .477 | .510 | .488 |
| 2 (124036) | .584 | .691 | .651 |
| 3 (124037) | .159 | .238 | .194 |
| 4 (124038) | .142 | .202 | .160 |
| 5 (124039) | .091 | .142 | .145 |
| 6 (124040) | .250 | .248 | .251 |
| 7 (124041) | .383 | .461 | .428 |
| Total | n/a | n/a | n/a |

*Pearson’s correlation*

For original results see spv file “syracuse-data-notext-u2-simple-transpose-sum-result-correlation.spv”.

**Pairwise correlation regarding criterion code “1 (124035)”**

Mean correlation for all judges=.728

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2B | 2C | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2H | 2J | 2K | 2L |
| 2A | .612\*\* | .625\*\* | .704\*\* | .625\*\* | .617\*\* | .598\*\* | .600\*\* | .605\*\* | .661\*\* | .660\*\* |
| 2B |  | .719\*\* | .793\*\* | .806\*\* | .759\*\* | .675\*\* | .803\*\* | .768\*\* | .762\*\* | .781\*\* |
| 2C |  |  | .756\*\* | .758\*\* | .727\*\* | .648\*\* | .739\*\* | .692\*\* | .700\*\* | .706\*\* |
| 2D |  |  |  | .801\*\* | .790\*\* | .715\*\* | .797\*\* | .747\*\* | .731\*\* | .803\*\* |
| 2E |  |  |  |  | .688\*\* | .681\*\* | .751\*\* | .708\*\* | .734\*\* | .777\*\* |
| 2F |  |  |  |  |  | .652\*\* | .827\*\* | .802\*\* | .692\*\* | .796\*\* |
| 2G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .699\*\* | .659\*\* | .691\*\* | .706\*\* |
| 2H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .862\*\* | .728\*\* | .897\*\* |
| 2J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .736\*\* | .900\*\* |
| 2K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .764\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

Mean correlation for librarians=.729

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2C | 2H | 2J | 2L |
| 2A | .625\*\* | .600\*\* | .605\*\* | .660\*\* |
| 2C |  | .739\*\* | .692\*\* | .706\*\* |
| 2H |  |  | .862\*\* | .897\*\* |
| 2J |  |  |  | .900\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

Mean correlation for faculty=.731

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2K |
| 2B | .793\*\* | .806\*\* | .759\*\* | .675\*\* | .762\*\* |
| 2D |  | .801\*\* | .790\*\* | .715\*\* | .731\*\* |
| 2E |  |  | .688\*\* | .681\*\* | .734\*\* |
| 2F |  |  |  | .652\*\* | .692\*\* |
| 2G |  |  |  |  | .691\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

**Pairwise correlation regarding criterion code “2 (124036)”**

Mean correlation for all judges=.750

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2B | 2C | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2H | 2J | 2K | 2L |
| 2A | .586\*\* | .591\*\* | .668\*\* | .605\*\* | .654\*\* | .488\*\* | .590\*\* | .628\*\* | .713\*\* | .602\*\* |
| 2B |  | .850\*\* | .822\*\* | .746\*\* | .828\*\* | .660\*\* | .898\*\* | .722\*\* | .858\*\* | .829\*\* |
| 2C |  |  | .873\*\* | .783\*\* | .883\*\* | .669\*\* | .822\*\* | .720\*\* | .869\*\* | .826\*\* |
| 2D |  |  |  | .720\*\* | .853\*\* | .667\*\* | .795\*\* | .769\*\* | .876\*\* | .825\*\* |
| 2E |  |  |  |  | .805\*\* | .591\*\* | .723\*\* | .763\*\* | .871\*\* | .811\*\* |
| 2F |  |  |  |  |  | .709\*\* | .842\*\* | .724\*\* | .859\*\* | .861\*\* |
| 2G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .693\*\* | .637\*\* | .637\*\* | .735\*\* |
| 2H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .636\*\* | .801\*\* | .849\*\* |
| 2J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .817\*\* | .748\*\* |
| 2K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .867\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

Mean correlation for librarians=.701

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2C | 2H | 2J | 2L |
| 2A | .591\*\* | .590\*\* | .628\*\* | .602\*\* |
| 2C |  | .822\*\* | .720\*\* | .826\*\* |
| 2H |  |  | .636\*\* | .849\*\* |
| 2J |  |  |  | .748\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

Mean correlation for faculty=.767

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2K |
| 2B | .822\*\* | .746\*\* | .828\*\* | .660\*\* | .858\*\* |
| 2D |  | .720\*\* | .853\*\* | .667\*\* | .876\*\* |
| 2E |  |  | .805\*\* | .591\*\* | .871\*\* |
| 2F |  |  |  | .709\*\* | .859\*\* |
| 2G |  |  |  |  | .637\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

**Pairwise correlation regarding criterion code “3 (124037)”**

Mean correlation for all judges=.373

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2B | 2C | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2H | 2J | 2K | 2L |
| 2A | .175 | .138 | .207\* | .255\* | .080 | .119 | .122 | -.007 | .164 | .301\*\* |
| 2B |  | .516\*\* | .535\*\* | .492\*\* | .446\*\* | .333\*\* | .372\*\* | .366\*\* | .358\*\* | .463\*\* |
| 2C |  |  | .482\*\* | .455\*\* | .585\*\* | .387\*\* | .461\*\* | .456\*\* | .380\*\* | .478\*\* |
| 2D |  |  |  | .500\*\* | .453\*\* | .490\*\* | .556\*\* | .375\*\* | .369\*\* | .507\*\* |
| 2E |  |  |  |  | .423\*\* | .394\*\* | .363\*\* | .344\*\* | .368\*\* | .463\*\* |
| 2F |  |  |  |  |  | .419\*\* | .461\*\* | .396\*\* | .404\*\* | .453\*\* |
| 2G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .542\*\* | .374\*\* | .238\*\* | .259\*\* |
| 2H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .413\*\* | .347\*\* | .405\*\* |
| 2J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .258\*\* | .342\*\* |
| 2K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .459\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level

Mean correlation for librarians=.311

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2C | 2H | 2J | 2L |
| 2A | .138 | .122 | -.007 | .301\*\* |
| 2C |  | .461\*\* | .456\*\* | .478\*\* |
| 2H |  |  | .413\*\* | .405\*\* |
| 2J |  |  |  | .342\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level

Mean correlation for faculty=.415

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2K |
| 2B | .535\*\* | .492\*\* | .446\*\* | .333\*\* | .358\*\* |
| 2D |  | .500\*\* | .453\*\* | .490\*\* | .369\*\* |
| 2E |  |  | .423\*\* | .394\*\* | .368\*\* |
| 2F |  |  |  | .419\*\* | .404\*\* |
| 2G |  |  |  |  | .238\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level

**Pairwise correlation regarding criterion code “4 (124038)”**

Mean correlation for all judges=.377

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2B | 2C | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2H | 2J | 2K | 2L |
| 2A | .287\*\* | .218\* | .391\*\* | .308\*\* | .219\* | .234\* | .277\*\* | .215\* | .304\*\* | .136 |
| 2B |  | .390\*\* | .464\*\* | .510\*\* | .512\*\* | .247\* | .429\*\* | .261\*\* | .426\*\* | .425\*\* |
| 2C |  |  | .459\*\* | .554\*\* | .332\*\* | .324\*\* | .419\*\* | .382\*\* | .471\*\* | .414\*\* |
| 2D |  |  |  | .531\*\* | .419\*\* | .346\*\* | .407\*\* | .426\*\* | .559\*\* | .458\*\* |
| 2E |  |  |  |  | .546\*\* | .413\*\* | .464\*\* | .274\*\* | .429\*\* | .436\*\* |
| 2F |  |  |  |  |  | .332\*\* | .369\*\* | .353\*\* | .301\*\* | .420\*\* |
| 2G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .524\*\* | .343\*\* | .239\*\* | .339\*\* |
| 2H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .364\*\* | .345\*\* | .479\*\* |
| 2J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .266\*\* | .450\*\* |
| 2K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .299\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level

Mean correlation for librarians=.335

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2C | 2H | 2J | 2L |
| 2A | .218\* | .277\*\* | .215\* | .136 |
| 2C |  | .419\*\* | .382\*\* | .414\*\* |
| 2H |  |  | .364\*\* | .479\*\* |
| 2J |  |  |  | .450\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level

Mean correlation for faculty=.418

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2K |
| 2B | .464\*\* | .510\*\* | .512\*\* | .247\* | .426\*\* |
| 2D |  | .531\*\* | .419\*\* | .346\*\* | .559\*\* |
| 2E |  |  | .546\*\* | .413\*\* | .429\*\* |
| 2F |  |  |  | .332\*\* | .301\*\* |
| 2G |  |  |  |  | .239\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level

**Pairwise correlation regarding criterion code “5 (124039)”**

Mean correlation for all judges=.350

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2B | 2C | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2H | 2J | 2K | 2L |
| 2A | .321\*\* | .054 | .276\*\* | .447\*\* | .340\*\* | .250\* | .180 | .110 | .219\* | .302\*\* |
| 2B |  | .459\*\* | .491\*\* | .558\*\* | .400\*\* | .269\*\* | .282\*\* | .458\*\* | .422\*\* | .508\*\* |
| 2C |  |  | .432\*\* | .440\*\* | .328\*\* | .223\* | .346\*\* | .523\*\* | .211\* | .257\*\* |
| 2D |  |  |  | .445\*\* | .397\*\* | .231\* | .339\*\* | .376\*\* | .401\*\* | .411\*\* |
| 2E |  |  |  |  | .346\*\* | .340\*\* | .308\*\* | .447\*\* | .341\*\* | .355\*\* |
| 2F |  |  |  |  |  | .389\*\* | .505\*\* | .251\* | .376\*\* | .454\*\* |
| 2G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .414\*\* | .295\*\* | .318\*\* | .349\*\* |
| 2H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .364\*\* | .282\*\* | .360\*\* |
| 2J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .282\*\* | .361\*\* |
| 2K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .415\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level

Mean correlation for librarians=.286

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2C | 2H | 2J | 2L |
| 2A | .054 | .180 | .110 | .302\*\* |
| 2C |  | .346\*\* | .523\*\* | .257\*\* |
| 2H |  |  | .364\*\* | .360\*\* |
| 2J |  |  |  | .361\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

Mean correlation for faculty=.382

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2K |
| 2B | .491\*\* | .558\*\* | .400\*\* | .269\*\* | .422\*\* |
| 2D |  | .445\*\* | .397\*\* | .231\* | .401\*\* |
| 2E |  |  | .346\*\* | .340\*\* | .341\*\* |
| 2F |  |  |  | .389\*\* | .376\*\* |
| 2G |  |  |  |  | .318\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level

**Pairwise correlation regarding criterion code “6 (124040)”**

Mean correlation for all judges=.484

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2B | 2C | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2H | 2J | 2K | 2L |
| 2A | .430\*\* | .415\*\* | .361\*\* | .396\*\* | .190 | .347\*\* | .474\*\* | .242\* | .409\*\* | .442\*\* |
| 2B |  | .570\*\* | .600\*\* | .497\*\* | .495\*\* | .503\*\* | .589\*\* | .334\*\* | .548\*\* | .588\*\* |
| 2C |  |  | .504\*\* | .517\*\* | .464\*\* | .562\*\* | .484\*\* | .333\*\* | .424\*\* | .557\*\* |
| 2D |  |  |  | .630\*\* | .514\*\* | .473\*\* | .649\*\* | .511\*\* | .546\*\* | .693\*\* |
| 2E |  |  |  |  | .364\*\* | .451\*\* | .569\*\* | .449\*\* | .568\*\* | .537\*\* |
| 2F |  |  |  |  |  | .424\*\* | .482\*\* | .332\*\* | .417\*\* | .548\*\* |
| 2G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .482\*\* | .347\*\* | .586\*\* | .466\*\* |
| 2H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .453\*\* | .574\*\* | .651\*\* |
| 2J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .509\*\* | .545\*\* |
| 2K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .567\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level

Mean correlation for librarians=.460

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2C | 2H | 2J | 2L |
| 2A | .415\*\* | .474\*\* | .242\* | .442\*\* |
| 2C |  | .484\*\* | .333\*\* | .557\*\* |
| 2H |  |  | .453\*\* | .651\*\* |
| 2J |  |  |  | .545\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level

Mean correlation for faculty=.508

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2K |
| 2B | .600\*\* | .497\*\* | .495\*\* | .503\*\* | .548\*\* |
| 2D |  | .630\*\* | .514\*\* | .473\*\* | .546\*\* |
| 2E |  |  | .364\*\* | .451\*\* | .568\*\* |
| 2F |  |  |  | .424\*\* | .417\*\* |
| 2G |  |  |  |  | .586\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

**Pairwise correlation regarding criterion code “7 (124041)”**

Mean correlation for all judges=.637

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2B | 2C | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2H | 2J | 2K | 2L |
| 2A | .328\*\* | .449\*\* | .311\*\* | .355\*\* | .355\*\* | .253\* | .356\*\* | .390\*\* | .367\*\* | .320\*\* |
| 2B |  | .711\*\* | .828\*\* | .690\*\* | .695\*\* | .638\*\* | .773\*\* | .726\*\* | .739\*\* | .735\*\* |
| 2C |  |  | .712\*\* | .721\*\* | .683\*\* | .614\*\* | .752\*\* | .733\*\* | .696\*\* | .766\*\* |
| 2D |  |  |  | .716\*\* | .678\*\* | .607\*\* | .747\*\* | .727\*\* | .735\*\* | .756\*\* |
| 2E |  |  |  |  | .667\*\* | .509\*\* | .718\*\* | .755\*\* | .583\*\* | .858\*\* |
| 2F |  |  |  |  |  | .610\*\* | .680\*\* | .714\*\* | .716\*\* | .763\*\* |
| 2G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .639\*\* | .590\*\* | .673\*\* | .520\*\* |
| 2H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .706\*\* | .714\*\* | .734\*\* |
| 2J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .696\*\* | .873\*\* |
| 2K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .682\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level

Mean correlation for librarians=.608

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2C | 2H | 2J | 2L |
| 2A | .449\*\* | .356\*\* | .390\*\* | .320\*\* |
| 2C |  | .752\*\* | .733\*\* | .766\*\* |
| 2H |  |  | .706\*\* | .734\*\* |
| 2J |  |  |  | .873\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

Mean correlation for faculty=.672

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2K |
| 2B | .828\*\* | .690\*\* | .695\*\* | .638\*\* | .739\*\* |
| 2D |  | .716\*\* | .678\*\* | .607\*\* | .735\*\* |
| 2E |  |  | .667\*\* | .509\*\* | .583\*\* |
| 2F |  |  |  | .610\*\* | .716\*\* |
| 2G |  |  |  |  | .673\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

**Pairwise correlation regarding total scores**

Mean correlation for all judges=.725

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2B | 2C | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2H | 2J | 2K | 2L |
| 2A | .614\*\* | .511\*\* | .647\*\* | .598\*\* | .548\*\* | .525\*\* | .592\*\* | .492\*\* | .603\*\* | .622\*\* |
| 2B |  | .760\*\* | .812\*\* | .793\*\* | .771\*\* | .686\*\* | .760\*\* | .726\*\* | .783\*\* | .788\*\* |
| 2C |  |  | .778\*\* | .758\*\* | .753\*\* | .700\*\* | .739\*\* | .743\*\* | .681\*\* | .750\*\* |
| 2D |  |  |  | .810\*\* | .796\*\* | .733\*\* | .825\*\* | .785\*\* | .770\*\* | .816\*\* |
| 2E |  |  |  |  | .769\*\* | .702\*\* | .759\*\* | .731\*\* | .776\*\* | .801\*\* |
| 2F |  |  |  |  |  | .701\*\* | .796\*\* | .739\*\* | .745\*\* | .791\*\* |
| 2G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .798\*\* | .720\*\* | .698\*\* | .721\*\* |
| 2H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .796\*\* | .748\*\* | .809\*\* |
| 2J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .695\*\* | .799\*\* |
| 2K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .734\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

Mean correlation for librarians=.685

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2C | 2H | 2J | 2L |
| 2A | .511\*\* | .592\*\* | .492\*\* | .622\*\* |
| 2C |  | .739\*\* | .743\*\* | .750\*\* |
| 2H |  |  | .796\*\* | .809\*\* |
| 2J |  |  |  | .799\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

Mean correlation for faculty=.756

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2D | 2E | 2F | 2G | 2K |
| 2B | .812\*\* | .793\*\* | .771\*\* | .686\*\* | .783\*\* |
| 2D |  | .810\*\* | .796\*\* | .733\*\* | .770\*\* |
| 2E |  |  | .769\*\* | .702\*\* | .776\*\* |
| 2F |  |  |  | .701\*\* | .745\*\* |
| 2G |  |  |  |  | .698\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

Summary of Mean Pearson’s Correlation

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Criterion | Librarians(1) | Faculty(2) | All judges |
| 1 (124035) | .729 | .731 | .728 |
| 2 (124036) | .701 | .767 | .750 |
| 3 (124037) | .311 | .415 | .373 |
| 4 (124038) | .335 | .418 | .377 |
| 5 (124039) | .286 | .382 | .350 |
| 6 (124040) | .460 | .508 | .484 |
| 7 (124041) | .608 | .672 | .637 |
| Total | .685 | .756 | .725 |