

*RAILS
Institution #10 Data Analysis*
Bei Yu & Megan Oakleaf

Table: librarian: 1; faculty: 2

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| institute | A | B | C | D | E | F | G | H | J | K | L |
| 10 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 1 |

1. **Kripendorff’s Alpha measure:**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| criterion | All judges | All librarians | All faculty |
| 17457 | .7290 | .7333 | .7268 |
| 17458 | .3291 | .3757 | .2682 |
| 17459 | .3709 | .3555 | .3879 |
| 17460 | .7346 | .7444 | .7146 |
| 17461 | .4134 | .4253 | .3394 |
| 17462 | .7850 | .7935 | .7702 |
| 17463 | .8117 | .8245 | .7706 |
| 17464 | .6551 | .6913 | .6073 |
| 17465 | .4750 | .4797 | .4718 |
| Total score | .7001 | .7311 | .6431 |

1. **Cohen’s Kappa**

**pairwise Kappa agreement on criterion code 17457:**

Mean Kappa for all judges=.570

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10C | 10D | 10E | 10F | 10G | 10H | 10J | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .627 | .707 | .401 | .621 | .674 | .606 | .535 | .530 | .657 | .635 |
| 10B |  | .655 | .440 | .593 | .592 | .620 | .455 | .585 | .641 | .549 |
| 10C |  |  | .486 | .563 | .742 | .575 | .529 | .529 | .727 | .656 |
| 10D |  |  |  | .468 | .551 | .476 | .277 | .305 | .503 | .402 |
| 10E |  |  |  |  | .623 | .810 | .462 | .481 | .700 | .729 |
| 10F |  |  |  |  |  | .636 | .529 | .499 | .725 | .716 |
| 10G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .479 | .521 | .651 | .745 |
| 10H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .516 | .469 | .461 |
| 10J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .534 | .455 |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .699 |

Mean Kappa for librarian=.599

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10D | 10E | 10G | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .627 | .401 | .621 | .606 | .657 | .635 |
| 10B |  | .440 | .593 | .620 | .641 | .549 |
| 10D |  |  | .468 | .476 | .503 | .402 |
| 10E |  |  |  | .810 | .700 | .729 |
| 10G |  |  |  |  | .651 | .745 |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  | .699 |

Mean Kappa for faculty=.557

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10F | 10H | 10J |
| 10C | .742 | .529 | .529 |
| 10F |  | .529 | .499 |
| 10H |  |  | .516 |

**pairwise Kappa agreement on criterion code 17458:**

Mean Kappa for all judges=.241

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10C | 10D | 10E | 10F | 10G | 10H | 10J | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .214 | .381 | .389 | .225 | .293 | .145 | .253 | .308 | .384 | .231 |
| 10B |  | .124 | .379 | .344 | .610 | .304 | .164 | .299 | .335 | .288 |
| 10C |  |  | .256 | .062 | .168 | .218 | .246 | .255 | .161 | .026 |
| 10D |  |  |  | .126 | .281 | .156 | .099 | .216 | .259 | .162 |
| 10E |  |  |  |  | .239 | .167 | .103 | .203 | .229 | .124 |
| 10F |  |  |  |  |  | .458 | .240 | .373 | .408 | .331 |
| 10G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .073 | .346 | .336 | .325 |
| 10H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .108 | .119 | -.021 |
| 10J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .269 | .082 |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .370 |

Mean Kappa for librarian=.262

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10D | 10E | 10G | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .214 | .389 | .225 | .145 | .384 | .231 |
| 10B |  | .379 | .344 | .304 | .335 | .288 |
| 10D |  |  | .126 | .156 | .259 | .162 |
| 10E |  |  |  | .167 | .229 | .124 |
| 10G |  |  |  |  | .336 | .325 |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  | .370 |

Mean Kappa for faculty=.232

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10F | 10H | 10J |
| 10C | .168 | .246 | .255 |
| 10F |  | .240 | .373 |
| 10H |  |  | .108 |

**pairwise Kappa agreement on criterion code 17459:**

Mean Kappa for all judges=.315

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10C | 10D | 10E | 10F | 10G | 10H | 10J | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .400 | .428 | .349 | .130 | .389 | .579 | .327 | .450 | .375 | .429 |
| 10B |  | .329 | .273 | .227 | .488 | .445 | .376 | .345 | .317 | .502 |
| 10C |  |  | .288 | .148 | .217 | .444 | .277 | .473 | .434 | .296 |
| 10D |  |  |  | .114 | .313 | .338 | .137 | .231 | .307 | .242 |
| 10E |  |  |  |  | .364 | .187 | .076 | .139 | .131 | .248 |
| 10F |  |  |  |  |  | .397 | .248 | .305 | .269 | .402 |
| 10G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .259 | .421 | .280 | .497 |
| 10H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .242 | .268 | .289 |
| 10J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .279 | .284 |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .338 |

Mean Kappa for librarian=.319

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10D | 10E | 10G | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .400 | .349 | .130 | .579 | .375 | .429 |
| 10B |  | .273 | .227 | .445 | .317 | .502 |
| 10D |  |  | .114 | .338 | .307 | .242 |
| 10E |  |  |  | .187 | .131 | .248 |
| 10G |  |  |  |  | .280 | .497 |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  | .338 |

Mean Kappa for faculty=.294

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10F | 10H | 10J |
| 10C | .217 | .277 | .473 |
| 10F |  | .248 | .305 |
| 10H |  |  | .242 |

**pairwise Kappa agreement on criterion code 17460:**

Mean Kappa for all judges=.749

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10C | 10D | 10E | 10F | 10G | 10H | 10J | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .663 | .581 | .764 | .797 | .796 | .750 | .764 | .634 | .709 | .690 |
| 10B |  | .700 | .769 | .784 | .800 | .632 | .799 | .833 | .878 | .816 |
| 10C |  |  | .556 | .570 | .615 | .500 | .643 | .688 | .733 | .716 |
| 10D |  |  |  | .855 | .838 | .708 | .870 | .723 | .798 | .733 |
| 10E |  |  |  |  | .855 | .775 | .823 | .739 | .814 | .749 |
| 10F |  |  |  |  |  | .790 | .903 | .785 | .767 | .827 |
| 10G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .791 | .634 | .674 | .673 |
| 10H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .784 | .798 | .795 |
| 10J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .834 | .832 |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .862 |

Mean Kappa for librarian=.757

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10D | 10E | 10G | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .663 | .764 | .797 | .750 | .709 | .690 |
| 10B |  | .769 | .784 | .632 | .878 | .816 |
| 10D |  |  | .855 | .708 | .798 | .733 |
| 10E |  |  |  | .775 | .814 | .749 |
| 10G |  |  |  |  | .674 | .673 |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  | .862 |

Mean Kappa for faculty=.736

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10F | 10H | 10J |
| 10C | .615 | .643 | .688 |
| 10F |  | .903 | .785 |
| 10H |  |  | .784 |

**pairwise Kappa agreement on criterion code 17461:**

Mean Kappa for all judges=.282

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10C | 10D | 10E | 10F | 10G | 10H | 10J | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .504 | .156 | .260 | .634 | .487 | .398 | .163 | .602 | .267 | .527 |
| 10B |  | .126 | .457 | .490 | .431 | .258 | -.026 | .468 | .125 | .500 |
| 10C |  |  | -.042 | .124 | -.037 | .103 | .259 | .274 | .213 | .220 |
| 10D |  |  |  | .272 | .332 | .181 | -.010 | .221 | .045 | .284 |
| 10E |  |  |  |  | .438 | .375 | .049 | .447 | .279 | .528 |
| 10F |  |  |  |  |  | .293 | .050 | .332 | .215 | .340 |
| 10G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .249 | .306 | .291 | .381 |
| 10H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .170 | .273 | .192 |
| 10J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .279 | .530 |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .234 |

Mean Kappa for librarian=.347

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10D | 10E | 10G | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .504 | .260 | .634 | .398 | .267 | .527 |
| 10B |  | .457 | .490 | .258 | .125 | .500 |
| 10D |  |  | .272 | .181 | .045 | .284 |
| 10E |  |  |  | .375 | .279 | .528 |
| 10G |  |  |  |  | .291 | .381 |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  | .234 |

Mean Kappa for faculty=.175

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10F | 10H | 10J |
| 10C | -.037 | .259 | .274 |
| 10F |  | .050 | .332 |
| 10H |  |  | .170 |

**pairwise Kappa agreement on criterion code 17462:**

Mean Kappa for all judges=.643

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10C | 10D | 10E | 10F | 10G | 10H | 10J | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .913 | .499 | .193 | .930 | .833 | .816 | .817 | .849 | .734 | .915 |
| 10B |  | .471 | .230 | .964 | .848 | .847 | .797 | .813 | .717 | .930 |
| 10C |  |  | .142 | .486 | .517 | .487 | .411 | .509 | .533 | .487 |
| 10D |  |  |  | .198 | .198 | .170 | .131 | .209 | .278 | .203 |
| 10E |  |  |  |  | .831 | .847 | .814 | .830 | .717 | .913 |
| 10F |  |  |  |  |  | .771 | .739 | .754 | .722 | .884 |
| 10G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .704 | .802 | .708 | .833 |
| 10H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .770 | .662 | .767 |
| 10J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .734 | .816 |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .688 |

Mean Kappa for librarian=.654

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10D | 10E | 10G | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .913 | .193 | .930 | .816 | .734 | .915 |
| 10B |  | .230 | .964 | .847 | .717 | .930 |
| 10D |  |  | .198 | .170 | .278 | .203 |
| 10E |  |  |  | .847 | .717 | .913 |
| 10G |  |  |  |  | .708 | .833 |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  | .688 |

Mean Kappa for faculty=.617

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10F | 10H | 10J |
| 10C | .517 | .411 | .509 |
| 10F |  | .739 | .754 |
| 10H |  |  | .770 |

**pairwise Kappa agreement on criterion code 17463:**

Mean Kappa for all judges=.604

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10C | 10D | 10E | 10F | 10G | 10H | 10J | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .618 | .465 | .519 | .597 | .580 | .646 | .646 | .602 | .691 | .630 |
| 10B |  | .556 | .582 | .687 | .692 | .748 | .634 | .697 | .705 | .640 |
| 10C |  |  | .453 | .461 | .432 | .483 | .416 | .449 | .529 | .497 |
| 10D |  |  |  | .540 | .547 | .599 | .532 | .568 | .514 | .561 |
| 10E |  |  |  |  | .759 | .670 | .567 | .707 | .631 | .615 |
| 10F |  |  |  |  |  | .675 | .634 | .746 | .599 | .716 |
| 10G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .600 | .681 | .686 | .730 |
| 10H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .596 | .707 | .543 |
| 10J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .584 | .701 |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .530 |

Mean Kappa for librarian=.626

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10D | 10E | 10G | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .618 | .519 | .597 | .646 | .691 | .630 |
| 10B |  | .582 | .687 | .748 | .705 | .640 |
| 10D |  |  | .540 | .599 | .514 | .561 |
| 10E |  |  |  | .670 | .631 | .615 |
| 10G |  |  |  |  | .686 | .730 |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  | .530 |

Mean Kappa for faculty=.546

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10F | 10H | 10J |
| 10C | .432 | .416 | .449 |
| 10F |  | .634 | .746 |
| 10H |  |  | .596 |

**pairwise Kappa agreement on criterion code 17464:**

Mean Kappa for all judges=.510

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10C | 10D | 10E | 10F | 10G | 10H | 10J | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .626 | .540 | .385 | .516 | .574 | .638 | .533 | .444 | .600 | .590 |
| 10B |  | .500 | .474 | .559 | .567 | .622 | .541 | .628 | .506 | .584 |
| 10C |  |  | .359 | .373 | .471 | .558 | .542 | .352 | .454 | .573 |
| 10D |  |  |  | .356 | .415 | .495 | .414 | .384 | .365 | .400 |
| 10E |  |  |  |  | .542 | .542 | .489 | .435 | .523 | .564 |
| 10F |  |  |  |  |  | .649 | .481 | .479 | .468 | .676 |
| 10G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .548 | .473 | .628 | .599 |
| 10H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .460 | .542 | .556 |
| 10J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .406 | .485 |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .550 |

Mean Kappa for librarian=.530

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10D | 10E | 10G | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .626 | .385 | .516 | .638 | .600 | .590 |
| 10B |  | .474 | .559 | .622 | .506 | .584 |
| 10D |  |  | .356 | .495 | .365 | .400 |
| 10E |  |  |  | .542 | .523 | .564 |
| 10G |  |  |  |  | .628 | .599 |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  | .550 |

Mean Kappa for faculty=.464

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10F | 10H | 10J |
| 10C | .471 | .542 | .352 |
| 10F |  | .481 | .479 |
| 10H |  |  | .460 |

**pairwise Kappa agreement on criterion code 17465:**

Mean Kappa for all judges=.278

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10C | 10D | 10E | 10F | 10G | 10H | 10J | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .264 | .315 | .208 | .396 | .257 | .338 | .283 | .347 | .259 | .309 |
| 10B |  | .266 | .229 | .243 | .324 | .308 | .263 | .267 | .190 | .340 |
| 10C |  |  | .223 | .249 | .365 | .360 | .217 | .354 | .181 | .387 |
| 10D |  |  |  | .279 | .347 | .209 | .158 | .218 | .191 | .287 |
| 10E |  |  |  |  | .517 | .257 | .228 | .274 | .335 | .368 |
| 10F |  |  |  |  |  | .295 | .250 | .392 | .199 | .468 |
| 10G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .249 | .175 | .157 | .247 |
| 10H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .278 | .200 | .297 |
| 10J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .157 | .310 |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .181 |

Mean Kappa for librarian=.266

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10D | 10E | 10G | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .264 | .208 | .396 | .338 | .259 | .309 |
| 10B |  | .229 | .243 | .308 | .190 | .340 |
| 10D |  |  | .279 | .209 | .191 | .287 |
| 10E |  |  |  | .257 | .335 | .368 |
| 10G |  |  |  |  | .157 | .247 |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  | .181 |

Mean Kappa for faculty=.309

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10F | 10H | 10J |
| 10C | .365 | .217 | .354 |
| 10F |  | .250 | .392 |
| 10H |  |  | .278 |

**Summary of Cohen’s Kappa**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Criterion | Librarian (1) | Faculty (2) | All judges |
| 17457 | .599 | .557 | .570 |
| 17458 | .262 | .232 | .241 |
| 17459 | .319 | .294 | .315 |
| 17460 | .757 | .736 | .749 |
| 17461 | .347 | .175 | .282 |
| 17462 | .654 | .617 | .643 |
| 17463 | .626 | .546 | .604 |
| 17464 | .530 | .464 | .510 |
| 17465 | .266 | .309 | .278 |
| Total score | n/a | n/a | n/a |

1. **Pearson’s correlation**

**Pairwise correlation regarding criterion code “17457”**

Mean Correlation all judges=.752

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10C | 10D | 10E | 10F | 10G | 10H | 10J | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .826\*\* | .849\*\* | .657\*\* | .724\*\* | .806\*\* | .747\*\* | .714\*\* | .774\*\* | .819\*\* | .757\*\* |
| 10B |  | .863\*\* | .634\*\* | .770\*\* | .818\*\* | .790\*\* | .678\*\* | .804\*\* | .861\*\* | .772\*\* |
| 10C |  |  | .653\*\* | .695\*\* | .853\*\* | .730\*\* | .717\*\* | .787\*\* | .867\*\* | .792\*\* |
| 10D |  |  |  | .655\*\* | .742\*\* | .685\*\* | .619\*\* | .579\*\* | .685\*\* | .654\*\* |
| 10E |  |  |  |  | .749\*\* | .836\*\* | .665\*\* | .693\*\* | .761\*\* | .754\*\* |
| 10F |  |  |  |  |  | .783\*\* | .751\*\* | .759\*\* | .839\*\* | .848\*\* |
| 10G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .661\*\* | .787\*\* | .761\*\* | .850\*\* |
| 10H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .715\*\* | .714\*\* | .668\*\* |
| 10J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .814\*\* | .771\*\* |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .808\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

Mean Correlation for librarian=.753

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10D | 10E | 10G | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .826\*\* | .657\*\* | .724\*\* | .747\*\* | .819\*\* | .757\*\* |
| 10B |  | .634\*\* | .770\*\* | .790\*\* | .861\*\* | .772\*\* |
| 10D |  |  | .655\*\* | .685\*\* | .685\*\* | .654\*\* |
| 10E |  |  |  | .836\*\* | .761\*\* | .754\*\* |
| 10G |  |  |  |  | .761\*\* | .850\*\* |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  | .808\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

Mean correlation for faculty=.764

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10F | 10H | 10J |
| 10C | .853\*\* | .717\*\* | .787\*\* |
| 10F |  | .751\*\* | .759\*\* |
| 10H |  |  | .715\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

**Pairwise correlation regarding criterion code “17458”**

Mean Correlation all judges=.361

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10C | 10D | 10E | 10F | 10G | 10H | 10J | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .361\*\* | .430\*\* | .502\*\* | .376\*\* | .476\*\* | .309\*\* | .403\*\* | .338\*\* | .545\*\* | .368\*\* |
| 10B |  | .343\*\* | .436\*\* | .542\*\* | .678\*\* | .471\*\* | .279\*\* | .335\*\* | .527\*\* | .481\*\* |
| 10C |  |  | .409\*\* | .214\* | .257\*\* | .274\*\* | .340\*\* | .230\* | .250\* | .195 |
| 10D |  |  |  | .216\* | .370\*\* | .251\* | .329\*\* | .138 | .394\*\* | .350\*\* |
| 10E |  |  |  |  | .465\*\* | .423\*\* | .126 | .324\*\* | .455\*\* | .228\* |
| 10F |  |  |  |  |  | .480\*\* | .398\*\* | .370\*\* | .584\*\* | .491\*\* |
| 10G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .281\*\* | .410\*\* | .422\*\* | .354\*\* |
| 10H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .221\* | .281\*\* | .110 |
| 10J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .299\*\* | .206\* |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .519\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level

\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level

Mean Correlation for librarian=.406

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10D | 10E | 10G | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .361\*\* | .502\*\* | .376\*\* | .309\*\* | .545\*\* | .368\*\* |
| 10B |  | .436\*\* | .542\*\* | .471\*\* | .527\*\* | .481\*\* |
| 10D |  |  | .216\* | .251\* | .394\*\* | .350\*\* |
| 10E |  |  |  | .423\*\* | .455\*\* | .228\* |
| 10G |  |  |  |  | .422\*\* | .354\*\* |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  | .519\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level

\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level

Mean correlation for faculty=.303

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10F | 10H | 10J |
| 10C | .257\*\* | .340\*\* | .230\* |
| 10F |  | .398\*\* | .370\*\* |
| 10H |  |  | .221\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level

\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level

**Pairwise correlation regarding criterion code “17459”**

Mean Correlation all judges=.510

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10C | 10D | 10E | 10F | 10G | 10H | 10J | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .534\*\* | .702\*\* | .545\*\* | .204\* | .679\*\* | .715\*\* | .587\*\* | .560\*\* | .591\*\* | .663\*\* |
| 10B |  | .587\*\* | .321\*\* | .246\* | .627\*\* | .514\*\* | .548\*\* | .471\*\* | .488\*\* | .625\*\* |
| 10C |  |  | .546\*\* | .252\* | .645\*\* | .606\*\* | .577\*\* | .623\*\* | .583\*\* | .597\*\* |
| 10D |  |  |  | .362\*\* | .530\*\* | .582\*\* | .432\*\* | .490\*\* | .529\*\* | .420\*\* |
| 10E |  |  |  |  | .369\*\* | .406\*\* | .164 | .240\* | .258\*\* | .278\*\* |
| 10F |  |  |  |  |  | .645\*\* | .539\*\* | .525\*\* | .545\*\* | .701\*\* |
| 10G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .521\*\* | .584\*\* | .599\*\* | .667\*\* |
| 10H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .522\*\* | .445\*\* | .540\*\* |
| 10J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .450\*\* | .525\*\* |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .537\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level

\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level

Mean Correlation for librarian=.480

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10D | 10E | 10G | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .534\*\* | .545\*\* | .204\* | .715\*\* | .591\*\* | .663\*\* |
| 10B |  | .321\*\* | .246\* | .514\*\* | .488\*\* | .625\*\* |
| 10D |  |  | .362\*\* | .582\*\* | .529\*\* | .420\*\* |
| 10E |  |  |  | .406\*\* | .258\*\* | .278\*\* |
| 10G |  |  |  |  | .599\*\* | .667\*\* |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  | .537\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level

\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level

Mean correlation for faculty=.572

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10F | 10H | 10J |
| 10C | .645\*\* | .577\*\* | .623\*\* |
| 10F |  | .539\*\* | .525\*\* |
| 10H |  |  | .522\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

**Pairwise correlation regarding criterion code “17460”**

Mean Correlation all judges=.748

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10C | 10D | 10E | 10F | 10G | 10H | 10J | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .530\*\* | .584\*\* | .682\*\* | .693\*\* | .694\*\* | .779\*\* | .724\*\* | .568\*\* | .634\*\* | .625\*\* |
| 10B |  | .701\*\* | .696\*\* | .800\*\* | .790\*\* | .693\*\* | .789\*\* | .804\*\* | .848\*\* | .829\*\* |
| 10C |  |  | .537\*\* | .634\*\* | .642\*\* | .591\*\* | .653\*\* | .746\*\* | .752\*\* | .770\*\* |
| 10D |  |  |  | .828\*\* | .797\*\* | .772\*\* | .859\*\* | .654\*\* | .764\*\* | .715\*\* |
| 10E |  |  |  |  | .828\*\* | .809\*\* | .860\*\* | .751\*\* | .868\*\* | .774\*\* |
| 10F |  |  |  |  |  | .836\*\* | .916\*\* | .755\*\* | .747\*\* | .831\*\* |
| 10G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .886\*\* | .652\*\* | .748\*\* | .769\*\* |
| 10H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .753\*\* | .802\*\* | .816\*\* |
| 10J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .828\*\* | .833\*\* |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .887\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

Mean Correlation for librarian=.750

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10D | 10E | 10G | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .530\*\* | .682\*\* | .693\*\* | .779\*\* | .634\*\* | .625\*\* |
| 10B |  | .696\*\* | .800\*\* | .693\*\* | .848\*\* | .829\*\* |
| 10D |  |  | .828\*\* | .772\*\* | .764\*\* | .715\*\* |
| 10E |  |  |  | .809\*\* | .868\*\* | .774\*\* |
| 10G |  |  |  |  | .748\*\* | .769\*\* |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  | .887\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

Mean correlation for faculty=.744

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10F | 10H | 10J |
| 10C | .642\*\* | .653\*\* | .746\*\* |
| 10F |  | .916\*\* | .755\*\* |
| 10H |  |  | .753\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

**Pairwise correlation regarding criterion code “17461”**

Mean Correlation all judges=.511

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10C | 10D | 10E | 10F | 10G | 10H | 10J | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .623\*\* | .444\*\* | .478\*\* | .742\*\* | .616\*\* | .623\*\* | .530\*\* | .654\*\* | .536\*\* | .579\*\* |
| 10B |  | .470\*\* | .483\*\* | .581\*\* | .455\*\* | .471\*\* | .571\*\* | .550\*\* | .369\*\* | .561\*\* |
| 10C |  |  | .453\*\* | .394\*\* | .112 | .440\*\* | .586\*\* | .552\*\* | .352\*\* | .498\*\* |
| 10D |  |  |  | .417\*\* | .400\*\* | .452\*\* | .482\*\* | .383\*\* | .383\*\* | .432\*\* |
| 10E |  |  |  |  | .502\*\* | .595\*\* | .517\*\* | .637\*\* | .526\*\* | .615\*\* |
| 10F |  |  |  |  |  | .537\*\* | .348\*\* | .469\*\* | .523\*\* | .395\*\* |
| 10G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .635\*\* | .567\*\* | .583\*\* | .640\*\* |
| 10H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .496\*\* | .553\*\* | .673\*\* |
| 10J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .528\*\* | .571\*\* |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .511\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

Mean Correlation for librarian=.533

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10D | 10E | 10G | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .623\*\* | .478\*\* | .742\*\* | .623\*\* | .536\*\* | .579\*\* |
| 10B |  | .483\*\* | .581\*\* | .471\*\* | .369\*\* | .561\*\* |
| 10D |  |  | .417\*\* | .452\*\* | .383\*\* | .432\*\* |
| 10E |  |  |  | .595\*\* | .526\*\* | .615\*\* |
| 10G |  |  |  |  | .583\*\* | .640\*\* |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  | .511\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

Mean correlation for faculty=.427

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10F | 10H | 10J |
| 10C | .112 | .586\*\* | .552\*\* |
| 10F |  | .348\*\* | .469\*\* |
| 10H |  |  | .496\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

**Pairwise correlation regarding criterion code “17462”**

Mean Correlation all judges=.733

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10C | 10D | 10E | 10F | 10G | 10H | 10J | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .905\*\* | .599\*\* | .543\*\* | .934\*\* | .818\*\* | .883\*\* | .827\*\* | .792\*\* | .840\*\* | .889\*\* |
| 10B |  | .508\*\* | .665\*\* | .938\*\* | .843\*\* | .885\*\* | .830\*\* | .784\*\* | .808\*\* | .912\*\* |
| 10C |  |  | .279\*\* | .574\*\* | .571\*\* | .562\*\* | .500\*\* | .521\*\* | .583\*\* | .561\*\* |
| 10D |  |  |  | .603\*\* | .557\*\* | .577\*\* | .521\*\* | .537\*\* | .580\*\* | .600\*\* |
| 10E |  |  |  |  | .817\*\* | .885\*\* | .860\*\* | .811\*\* | .808\*\* | .884\*\* |
| 10F |  |  |  |  |  | .807\*\* | .741\*\* | .698\*\* | .789\*\* | .872\*\* |
| 10G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .764\*\* | .816\*\* | .825\*\* | .890\*\* |
| 10H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .839\*\* | .826\*\* | .767\*\* |
| 10J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .757\*\* | .773\*\* |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .762\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

Mean Correlation for librarian=.791

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10D | 10E | 10G | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .905\*\* | .543\*\* | .934\*\* | .883\*\* | .840\*\* | .889\*\* |
| 10B |  | .665\*\* | .938\*\* | .885\*\* | .808\*\* | .912\*\* |
| 10D |  |  | .603\*\* | .577\*\* | .580\*\* | .600\*\* |
| 10E |  |  |  | .885\*\* | .808\*\* | .884\*\* |
| 10G |  |  |  |  | .825\*\* | .890\*\* |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  | .762\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

Mean correlation for faculty=.645

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10F | 10H | 10J |
| 10C | .571\*\* | .500\*\* | .521\*\* |
| 10F |  | .741\*\* | .698\*\* |
| 10H |  |  | .839\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

**Pairwise correlation regarding criterion code “17463”**

Mean Correlation all judges=.797

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10C | 10D | 10E | 10F | 10G | 10H | 10J | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .829\*\* | .716\*\* | .773\*\* | .815\*\* | .767\*\* | .843\*\* | .832\*\* | .843\*\* | .867\*\* | .804\*\* |
| 10B |  | .743\*\* | .754\*\* | .783\*\* | .786\*\* | .823\*\* | .823\*\* | .836\*\* | .908\*\* | .763\*\* |
| 10C |  |  | .695\*\* | .701\*\* | .692\*\* | .689\*\* | .702\*\* | .698\*\* | .706\*\* | .708\*\* |
| 10D |  |  |  | .700\*\* | .683\*\* | .764\*\* | .723\*\* | .732\*\* | .718\*\* | .783\*\* |
| 10E |  |  |  |  | .876\*\* | .873\*\* | .794\*\* | .948\*\* | .829\*\* | .904\*\* |
| 10F |  |  |  |  |  | .824\*\* | .786\*\* | .852\*\* | .812\*\* | .890\*\* |
| 10G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .796\*\* | .890\*\* | .889\*\* | .850\*\* |
| 10H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .806\*\* | .908\*\* | .784\*\* |
| 10J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .863\*\* | .871\*\* |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .807\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

Mean Correlation for librarian=.813

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10D | 10E | 10G | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .829\*\* | .773\*\* | .815\*\* | .843\*\* | .867\*\* | .804\*\* |
| 10B |  | .754\*\* | .783\*\* | .823\*\* | .908\*\* | .763\*\* |
| 10D |  |  | .700\*\* | .764\*\* | .718\*\* | .783\*\* |
| 10E |  |  |  | .873\*\* | .829\*\* | .904\*\* |
| 10G |  |  |  |  | .889\*\* | .850\*\* |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  | .807\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

Mean correlation for faculty=.756

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10F | 10H | 10J |
| 10C | .692\*\* | .702\*\* | .698\*\* |
| 10F |  | .786\*\* | .852\*\* |
| 10H |  |  | .806\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

**Pairwise correlation regarding criterion code “17464”**

Mean Correlation all judges=.641

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10C | 10D | 10E | 10F | 10G | 10H | 10J | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .768\*\* | .620\*\* | .560\*\* | .732\*\* | .646\*\* | .726\*\* | .663\*\* | .566\*\* | .691\*\* | .711\*\* |
| 10B |  | .723\*\* | .632\*\* | .722\*\* | .655\*\* | .777\*\* | .729\*\* | .725\*\* | .608\*\* | .739\*\* |
| 10C |  |  | .463\*\* | .599\*\* | .603\*\* | .741\*\* | .679\*\* | .431\*\* | .636\*\* | .738\*\* |
| 10D |  |  |  | .478\*\* | .522\*\* | .586\*\* | .545\*\* | .427\*\* | .429\*\* | .506\*\* |
| 10E |  |  |  |  | .605\*\* | .728\*\* | .635\*\* | .525\*\* | .645\*\* | .777\*\* |
| 10F |  |  |  |  |  | .762\*\* | .653\*\* | .539\*\* | .629\*\* | .771\*\* |
| 10G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .704\*\* | .552\*\* | .715\*\* | .772\*\* |
| 10H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .615\*\* | .695\*\* | .729\*\* |
| 10J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .463\*\* | .582\*\* |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .767\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

Mean Correlation for librarian=.670

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10D | 10E | 10G | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .768\*\* | .560\*\* | .732\*\* | .726\*\* | .691\*\* | .711\*\* |
| 10B |  | .632\*\* | .722\*\* | .777\*\* | .608\*\* | .739\*\* |
| 10D |  |  | .478\*\* | .586\*\* | .429\*\* | .506\*\* |
| 10E |  |  |  | .728\*\* | .645\*\* | .777\*\* |
| 10G |  |  |  |  | .715\*\* | .772\*\* |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  | .767\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

Mean correlation for faculty=.587

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10F | 10H | 10J |
| 10C | .603\*\* | .679\*\* | .431\*\* |
| 10F |  | .653\*\* | .539\*\* |
| 10H |  |  | .615\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

**Pairwise correlation regarding criterion code “17465”**

Mean Correlation all judges=.522

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10C | 10D | 10E | 10F | 10G | 10H | 10J | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .589\*\* | .588\*\* | .534\*\* | .699\*\* | .636\*\* | .601\*\* | .514\*\* | .531\*\* | .464\*\* | .573\*\* |
| 10B |  | .459\*\* | .573\*\* | .607\*\* | .659\*\* | .674\*\* | .419\*\* | .512\*\* | .485\*\* | .557\*\* |
| 10C |  |  | .511\*\* | .530\*\* | .617\*\* | .517\*\* | .381\*\* | .560\*\* | .357\*\* | .644\*\* |
| 10D |  |  |  | .551\*\* | .627\*\* | .521\*\* | .398\*\* | .420\*\* | .369\*\* | .558\*\* |
| 10E |  |  |  |  | .748\*\* | .641\*\* | .432\*\* | .530\*\* | .429\*\* | .538\*\* |
| 10F |  |  |  |  |  | .685\*\* | .484\*\* | .547\*\* | .420\*\* | .666\*\* |
| 10G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .437\*\* | .423\*\* | .466\*\* | .522\*\* |
| 10H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .426\*\* | .441\*\* | .438\*\* |
| 10J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .297\*\* | .565\*\* |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .359\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

Mean Correlation for librarian=.539

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10D | 10E | 10G | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .589\*\* | .534\*\* | .699\*\* | .601\*\* | .464\*\* | .573\*\* |
| 10B |  | .573\*\* | .607\*\* | .674\*\* | .485\*\* | .557\*\* |
| 10D |  |  | .551\*\* | .521\*\* | .369\*\* | .558\*\* |
| 10E |  |  |  | .641\*\* | .429\*\* | .538\*\* |
| 10G |  |  |  |  | .466\*\* | .522\*\* |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  | .359\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

Mean correlation for faculty=.503

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10F | 10H | 10J |
| 10C | .617\*\* | .381\*\* | .560\*\* |
| 10F |  | .484\*\* | .547\*\* |
| 10H |  |  | .426\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

**Pairwise correlation regarding total scores**

Mean Correlation all judges=.778

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10C | 10D | 10E | 10F | 10G | 10H | 10J | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .858\*\* | .798\*\* | .680\*\* | .787\*\* | .865\*\* | .875\*\* | .825\*\* | .814\*\* | .850\*\* | .847\*\* |
| 10B |  | .756\*\* | .700\*\* | .823\*\* | .833\*\* | .833\*\* | .812\*\* | .790\*\* | .808\*\* | .824\*\* |
| 10C |  |  | .621\*\* | .679\*\* | .731\*\* | .793\*\* | .766\*\* | .743\*\* | .758\*\* | .755\*\* |
| 10D |  |  |  | .605\*\* | .694\*\* | .716\*\* | .703\*\* | .625\*\* | .666\*\* | .655\*\* |
| 10E |  |  |  |  | .824\*\* | .846\*\* | .699\*\* | .748\*\* | .790\*\* | .844\*\* |
| 10F |  |  |  |  |  | .861\*\* | .776\*\* | .788\*\* | .806\*\* | .871\*\* |
| 10G |  |  |  |  |  |  | .802\*\* | .806\*\* | .885\*\* | .882\*\* |
| 10H |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .745\*\* | .833\*\* | .774\*\* |
| 10J |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .724\*\* | .795\*\* |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | .815\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

Mean Correlation for librarian=.790

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10B | 10D | 10E | 10G | 10K | 10L |
| 10A | .858\*\* | .680\*\* | .787\*\* | .875\*\* | .850\*\* | .847\*\* |
| 10B |  | .700\*\* | .823\*\* | .833\*\* | .808\*\* | .824\*\* |
| 10D |  |  | .605\*\* | .716\*\* | .666\*\* | .655\*\* |
| 10E |  |  |  | .846\*\* | .790\*\* | .844\*\* |
| 10G |  |  |  |  | .885\*\* | .882\*\* |
| 10K |  |  |  |  |  | .815\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

Mean correlation for faculty=.758

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 10F | 10H | 10J |
| 10C | .731\*\* | .766\*\* | .743\*\* |
| 10F |  | .776\*\* | .788\*\* |
| 10H |  |  | .745\*\* |

\*\*. Correlation is significant at the 0.01level

**Summary of Mean Pearson’s Correlation**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| criterion | Librarian (1) | Faculty (2) | All judges |
| 17457 | .753 | .764 | .752 |
| 17458 | .406 | .303 | .361 |
| 17459 | .480 | .572 | .510 |
| 17460 | .750 | .744 | .748 |
| 17461 | .533 | .427 | .511 |
| 17462 | .791 | .645 | .733 |
| 17463 | .813 | .756 | .797 |
| 17464 | .670 | .587 | .641 |
| 17465 | .539 | .503 | .522 |
| Total score | .790 | .758 | .778 |